BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06094295 0

FAULT AND RESPONSIBILITY

Professor Bruce Chapman
and
Professor Mayo Moran

Fall 2004

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 17 2004
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAULT AND RESPONSIBILITY

Professor Bruce Chapman
and
Professor Mayo Moran

Fall 2004

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/faultresponsibil00chap

FAULT AND RESPONSIBILITY

CONTENTS

I Introduction

"Moral Luck"—In Thomas Nagel, *Mortal Questions* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1979) 24 -38..... I-1

II Fault and Responsibility in Tort Law—General Theory

Holmes, O., "The Common Law" (Boston: Little Brown, 1881)..... II-1

Weinrib, E., "Liberty, Community, and Corrective Justice" 1(1) *Can. J. of Law & Jurisprudence* (1977) 3-17..... II-4

Honoré, T., "Responsibility and Luck," 104 *The Law Quarterly Review* (1988) 530-553..... II-12

III Fault and Responsibility in Tort Law—Special Problems

Vaughan v. *Menlove* (1837) 3 Bing. (N.C.) 468..... III-1

Laverdure et al. v. *City of Victoria* (1952) 7 W.W.R. 334..... III-4

McHale v. *Watson* (1966) 115 C.L.R. 199..... III-6

Nelson v. *Town of the Pas* (1969) 67 W.W.R. 580..... III-15

State v. *Williams* (1971) 484 P. 2d, 1167..... III-17

IV Fault and Responsibility in Criminal Law—General Theory

Duff, R.A., "Choice, Character, and Criminal Liability" 12 *Law and Philosophy* (1993) 345-383..... IV-1

Brudner, A., "Agency & Welfare in the Penal Law" in S. Shite, J. Gardner, & J. Horder, (eds.) *Action and Value in Criminal Law* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993) 21-53..... IV-21

Horder, J. "Gross Negligence and Criminal Culpability" 47 *U. of T. Law J.* (1997) 495-521..... IV-38

V Fault and Responsibility in Criminal Law—Special Problems

A. The *Mens Rea* Requirement

"Recklessness"—in R.A. Duff, *Intention, Agency & Criminal Liability: Philosophy of Action & The Criminal Law* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1990) 139-179..... V.A-1

Headnote from *D.P.P.* v. *Morgan* [1976] A.C. 182..... V.A-22

Headnote from *Pappajohn* v. *The Queen* [1980] 2 S.C.R. 120..... V.A-23

Headnote from *Sansregret* v. *The Queen* [1985] 1 S.C.R. 570..... V.A-24

Headnote from *R.* v. *Ewanchuk* (1998) 13 C.R. (5^{th}) 324 (C.A.)..... V.A-26

R. v. *Ewanchuk* (1999) 69 D.L.R. (4^{th}) 193 (S.C.C.)..... V.A-29

B. Defence of Provocation and Culture

Klimchuk, D., "Outrage, Self-Control, and Culpability" 44 *U. of T. Law J.* (1994) 441-468..... V.B-1

"Are Objective Standards Worth Saving? Exploring the Feminist Debate"—in M. Moran, *Rethinking The Reasonable Person* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2003) 198-231..... V.B-16

Golding, M.P. "The Cultural Defence" 15(2) *Ratio Juris* (June 2002) 146-158..... V.B-50

VI Individual Responsibility in 'Abnormal' Moral Contexts

Delgado, R. "'Rotten Social Background': Should the Criminal Law Recognize a Defence of Severe Environmental Deprivation?" 3 *Law & Inequality* (1985) 571-591..... VI-1

Jaspers, K., "German Guilt"— in R.A. Falk, G. Kolko, & R.J. Lipton (eds.), *Crimes of War* (New York: Random House, 1971) 476-485..... VI-12

The Shootings at the Berlin Wall Case (1992) BGHSt 39, 1, Bundesgerichtshof, Fifth Criminal Senate, in Raymond Youngs in *Sourcebook on German Law*, 2nd ed., (London: Cavendish, 2002) 621-681 [translated by author], currently available online at http://www.iuscomp.org/gla/judgments/bgh/s921103.htm VI-17

Calhoun, C., "Responsibility and Reproach" 99 *Ethics* (1989) 389-406..... VI-37

Wolf, S., ""The Legal and Moral Responsibility of Organizations" – in J. Pennock & J. Chapman (eds.), *NOMOS XXVII: Criminal Justice* (New York: New York UP, 1985) 267-286..... VI-47

VII Who Can Be Responsible?

Luban, D., "The Adversary System Excuse"— in D. Luban (ed.), *The Ethics of Lawyers* (New York: New York UP, 1994) 139-178 ..... VI-1

Dyzenhaus, D., "'With the Benefit of Hindsight': Dilemmas of Legality in the Face of Injustice"— in E.A. Christodoulidis and S. Veitch (eds.), *Lethe's Law: Justice, Law and Ethics in Reconciliation* (Oxford: Hart, 2001) 65-89..... VII-22

Kukathas, C., "Responsibility for past injustice: how to shift the burden." 2(2) *Politics, Philosophy & Economics* (2003) 165-190..... VII-35

VIII Time and Responsibility

Sher, G., "Ancient Wrongs & Modern Rights" 10(1) *Philosophy Pub. Affairs* (1980) 3-17..... VIII-1

Waldron, J., "Superseding Historic Justice" 103 *Ethics* (Oct 1992) 4-28..... VIII-9

Roberts, R., "The Morality of a Moral Statute of Limitations on Injustice" 7 *J. of Ethics* (2003) 115-138..... VIII-22

IX The Question of Remedy

Allen, J., "Balancing Justice and Social Unity: Political Theory and the Idea of a Truth and Reconciliation Commission" 49(3) *U. of T. Law J.* (1999) 315-353..... IX-1

Llewellyn, J., "Dealing With the Legacy of Native Residential School Abuse in Canada: Litigation, ADR, and Restorative Justice" 52(3) *U. of T. Law J.* (2002) 253-300..... IX-21

Brophy, A.L., "Some Conceptual and Legal Problems in Reparations for Slavery" 58 *N.Y.U. Ann. Surv. of Am. L.* (2003) 497-555..... IX-46

McGary, H. "Achieving Democratic Equality: Forgiveness, Reconciliation, and Reparations" 7 *J. of Ethics* (2003) 93-113..... IX-75